City of West Allis RFP-23-005 (Financial Auditing Services)

Pricing (not to exceed)

	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	Total
<u>CliftonLarsenAllen</u>						
Financial statements	\$66,665	\$69,305	\$71,946	\$74,894	\$77,909	\$360,719
Fed & state Single Audits	\$13,650	\$14,196	\$14,774	\$15,351	\$15,960	\$73,931
Hourly - Director	\$273	\$284	\$295	\$307	\$320	
Hourly - Manager	\$175	\$182	\$189	\$197	\$204	
Hourly - Senior	\$126	\$131	\$136	\$141	\$147	
Hourly - Associate	\$105	\$109	\$113	\$118	\$123	
<u>Sikich</u>						
Financial statements	\$65,000	\$68,250	\$71,665	\$75,250	\$79,010	\$359,175
Fed & state Single Audits	\$5,000	\$5,250	\$5,515	\$5,790	\$6,080	\$27,635
Hourly - Director	\$400					
Hourly - Manager	\$325					
Hourly - Senior	\$250					
Hourly - Associate	\$200					

Comments

- The 2023 base (financial statement audit) fees proposed represent a 15% to 18% increase from 2022. While exceptionally high, this is not unexpected in the current market. Similar increases were noted in other industries. Fees for both proposals were nearly identical, with only a 0.4% variance between the two.
- At first glance, the single audit fees for Sikich appear exceptionally favorable; however, it is important to note the following from the CLA proposal. "... we will work with the City to determine the hours and fee specific to each program. We have included the not-to exceed federal and state single audit fee for each major program based on a complex program which requires more hours to complete our services as requested in the City's RFP." CLA has extensive experience with the City and knows the amount of work our single audits need. In 2022, the Housing Choice program audit was extensive and demanded \$8,100 in audit fees, so the cautious not-to-exceed fees proposed by CLA make sense. It's important to note that actual fees are expected to be lower than the maximum, as evidenced by prior billings.
- The hourly fees for CLA are significantly more favorable than for Sikich.
- CLA is the City's current auditor and has a lengthy history. I am unaware of Sikich having any history with the city.
- CLA is highly experienced with audits of Wisconsin governments of all sizes. While Sikich did list two Wisconsin references, they were governments significantly smaller than West Allis.

Conclusion

CLA is a professional audit firm with significant experience auditing Wisconsin governments, including the City of West Allis. With CLA being the City's current auditor, and having competitive pricing, they are easily the vendor of choice.