

## RFP # 18-005 Public Works Asset and Work Order Management Solution

### Timeline and Summary of the Selection Process

- February 7, 2018 RFP #18-005 Released
- March 6, 2018 Proposal Due Date
- Received four (4) proposals
- AssetWorks
  - Cartegraph
  - DTS -VueWorks
  - Dude Solutions
- March 7-9, 12-15 RFP Evaluation Process with Evaluation Team Members:
- Joe Clesceri, IT, Project Manager
  - Dave Wepking, Project Sponsor
  - Jim Leu – DPW Fleet
  - Andi Hetzer –DPW Forestry
  - Tim Last – DPW Streets and Sanitation
  - Karyn Rittenhouse – DPW
  - Robert Barwick –Senior Buyer/Purchasing

Evaluations included review of each proposal included these topics:

- Experience in the industry
- References
- Customer feedback process
- Functional requirements
- System and application architecture
- System management
- Project management
- Training plan
- Implementation services
- Vendor hosted services
- Application support services
- Key personnel
- Warranties and maintenance
- Usability
- Interoperability

- Mobile applications
- Asset record tracking
- Asset life cycle management
- Inventory management
- Asset maintenance
- Fleet management
- Safety Management
- Work order management
- Time reporting
- Analytics and reporting
- Vendor support

**The initial scoresheet for #18-005**

Rating Factor	Weight	<u>AssetWorks</u>	<u>Cartegraph</u>	<u>DTS- VueWorks</u>	<u>Dude Solutions</u>
		Score	Score	Score	Score
Overall Capabilities to Meet the Functional Criteria	30	22.5	15	15	22.5
Ease of Use and Intuitivity for Staff and End-User.	15	8	8	8	8
Ease of Integration with Existing Software	15	7.5	7.5	7	7.5
Vendor Characteristics Including Experience, References, and Implementation Plan	10	8	7	6	8
Cost Estimate of a 5-Year Plan	30				
<b>TOTAL SCORE =</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>37.5</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>46</b>

After reviewing all proposals, all four vendors were contacted to conduct a remote demonstration of their product. A scenario situation was given to each vendor. The scenario included a scene where multiple work areas would be included, such as Police Dept, Water Dept, Building and Sign, Streets, and Inventory. Scoring is included with a total best score being 51 points.

- March 29, 2018      Cartegraph Remote Demo      43 points
- March 30, 2018      DTS-VueWorks Remote Demo      41 points
- April 2, 2018      Dude Solutions Remote Demo      27 points
- April 9, 2018      AssetWorks Remote Demo      50 points
- April 9, 2018      Evaluation Committee Reviewed each demo

At this point it was apparent to the Evaluation Committee that Dude Solutions was not quite ready to provide the solution that was required. Dude Solutions was eliminated from further consideration.

At this point it was decided that pricing should become a factor in the decision making process. Joe Slesceri prepared a detailed cost estimate. A summary of a five-year cost estimate as indicated in the RFP proposal of each remaining vendor is listed below.

**5-Year Estimate of EAM Costs**

<b>Item</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>DTS VueWorks</b>	<b>Cartegraph</b>	<b>AssetWorks</b>
1	Intall, configure, PM, etc	\$144,000	\$ 98,300	\$ 203,870
2	Software License	\$ 68,000	\$ -	\$ 85,775
3	Software Maintenance	\$ 100,000	\$ -	\$ 125,320
4	Software Subscription	\$ -	\$ 511,643	\$ -
	Hosting Set Up Fee			
5	Hosting	\$ 60,000	\$ -	\$ 149,190
6	Test Environment	\$ -	\$ 12,366	\$ -
7	Fixed Fee Service, #Q02272018, Fuel Integration, Petrovend	\$ -	\$ 6,000	\$ -
8	Technical Support, #Q02272018, Fuel Integration, Petrovend	\$ -	\$ 4,153	\$ -
9	Estimated Expenses	\$ -	\$ 14,000	\$ -
	Estimated Costs	\$ 372,000	\$ 646,462	\$ 564,155

AssetWorks was considered the top-rated solution, while Cartegraph and DTS-VueWorks were rated as equals to each other. To keep on schedule, the Evaluation Committee really wanted to narrow the selection down to two vendors. Since it was known that Cartegraph was not meeting a few requirements, such as ease of use, mobility, and having the highest cost solution, and that the committee was not as familiar with DTS-Vueworks, but they were very intrigued by their solution. AssetWorks and DTS-VueWorks were selected as the two finalists.

The two remaining vendors were then scheduled to make a site visit to West Allis DPW for a more formal presentation of their Asset Management solution.

The live demonstration was broken down into six separate sessions. One general overview session, and five focused sessions prepared for each division at Public Works.

April 30, 2018 Live on-site Demo by AssetWorks Average score of 4.4 out of 5 (413 points)

May 7, 2018 Live on-site demo by DTS-VueWorks Average score of 4.0 out of 5 (359 points)

May 9, 2018 After careful consideration, an unanimous decision was made by the entire Evaluation Committee that AssetWorks was the best Enterprise Asset Management solution for the City of West Allis – Department of Public Works.

Key factors that made this decision possible include:

- AssetWorks has the most intuitive (ease of use) solution available.
- AssetWorks provided the best mobile app and data syncing solution.
- AssetWorks provided the best Citizen portal to handle citizen requests.
- AssetWorks provided the best reporting tools, and provided an easy solution to getting data/information out of the system.
- AssetWorks is utilized by many local government agencies in Southeastern Wisconsin, allowing for localized cooperation and user-experts to help develop best practices in asset management.
- The AssetWorks solution is very configurable, allowing for internal customization of screen views and reports.
- Integrates seamlessly with our current GIS system which will link assets to work orders and service requests.

Joe Clesceri, Robert Barwick, and Assistant City Attorney Sheryl Kuhary reviewed all contracts, and were able to work with AssetWorks to come to an agreement on the contracts. Pricing was negotiated to a lower cost, as well as stabilization of future long-term costs.

With approval of the West Allis Common Council, we would like to enter into a long term relationship with AssetWorks, with implementation and training to start as early as September 2018.